

1177 & 1187 West 5th Street, Hamilton - ZAC-22-047

Commenting Agency	Comment No.	Comment	Responsible Consultant	Response
Natural Heritage (Melissa Kiddie)	1	Technical Comments A TPP review fee is to be submitted to the City. At this time, it is unclear if this fee has been provided. Further clarification is required. The 2022 review fee is \$635.00.	UrbanSolutions	A \$635.00 TPP Review Fee was submitted to the City during the initial June 30, 2022 submission.
	2	The TPP is to be prepared by a recognized tree management professional (i.e., certified arborist, registered professional forester or landscape architect). A stamp has not been included on the drawings. The drawings are to be revised to include this information.	Adesso Design	Revised TPP includes stamp as noted.
	3	The decision to retain is to be based on condition, aesthetics, age, and species. Opportunities to retain more trees on the property are to be explored.	Adesso Design	Noted.
	4	Tree #1 (Field Maple) has been proposed to be removed. Since this tree has been identified as a public tree, it is advised that the City's Forestry Department be consulted.	Adesso Design	Noted.
	5	Trees #7 (Black Walnut), 8 (Black Walnut) and 23 (Manitoba Maple) have been proposed to be removed. These trees have been identified as boundary trees. As per the Ontario Forestry Act, permission is required from all landowners prior to removal of trees. It is unclear if this permission has been granted. Further clarification is required.	Adesso Design	Neighbouring lands will be notified of the proposed removals. Trees will only be removed once permission has been granted. Permission from neighbours to follow. UPDATE (2023) - PERMISSION GRANTED and forwarded to Mark Michniak.
	6	Trees #12 (Thornless Honeylocust) and 13 (Colorado Blue Spruce) have been proposed to be retained on site. Based on the Concept Plan, development is proposed within the dripline of these trees. It is unclear how these trees will be protected. Further clarification is required.	Adesso Design	There is only a slight encroachment to the mtpz. Additionally, tree #12 and #13 have a high construction tolerance to the minimal work occurring within the mtpz.
	7	Trees #20 and 21 have been identified as Downy Hawthorn (<i>Crataegus mollis</i>). This species has been identified as locally uncommon within the City. Opportunities to retain these trees are to be explored.	Adesso Design	Opportunities were explored to retain trees #20 and 21 however, given their condition, proximity to the development (underground parking) and the subsequent grading that will be occurring within their root zone, these trees cannot be saved. Additionally, a proposed swale conflicts with these trees.
	8	Compensation: To ensure that existing cover is maintained, 1 for 1 compensation is required for all trees (10 cm DBH or greater) that are proposed to be removed. This compensation has not been clearly identified on the drawing. The drawing is to be revised to include this information.	Adesso Design	A compensation chart has been provided on L1.
	9	Tree Resources: A Tree Protection Plan (TPP) (drawings L-1 and L-2) has been prepared by Adesso Design Inc. March 22, 2022. Based on this Plan, 31 trees (including 5 public trees) have been inventoried. Of these, 17 trees (including 1 public tree) are proposed to be removed. Since trees provide a variety of functions (i.e., canopy cover, energy conservation, mental health benefits) to the overall community and are integral to minimizing the impacts of air pollution and climate change, there is concern with the removal. Due to these concerns, the TPP has not been approved.	Adesso Design	21 total trees are proposed to be removed. 18 total trees, including 5 street trees, have been proposed as compensation - see landscape concept plan in Urban Design Brief.
	10	To ensure that tree planting can be accommodated on site, appropriate setbacks (i.e., 3.0 metres) are required to be incorporated into the zoning.	UrbanSolutions	The extent of the underground parking has been shifted back away from the north property line to allow for large tree plantings.
Cultural Heritage (Chloe Richer)	11	Archaeological As part of previous application FC-16-080, a Stage 1-2 archaeological report (P018-0828-2016) for 1187 West 5th Street was submitted to the City and the Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries. The Province signed off on the reports for compliance with licensing requirements in a letter dated January 11, 2017. Staff is of the opinion that the municipal interest in the archaeology of this portion of the site has been satisfied but do not have a copy of the report on file and require it be submitted to verify.	UrbanSolutions	Please see the enclosed archaeological report.

Urban Design (Edward Winter)	12	Concept Plan The proposed 2.4 m balcony projection into the west (street-facing) front yard would limit the amount of landscaping possible as this includes solid support walls on both sides of the balcony.	KNYMH	The balcony projections have been reduced.
	13	Confirm if private trees can be accommodated on site to replace the existing trees that are planned to be removed to facilitate the development	Addresso Design	A total of 13 trees have been proposed on property in order to compensate for the trees that are being removed.
	14	The extent of underground parking, while not dimensioned, does not appear to leave sufficient soil volume to support tree planting along the property lines. Please confirm if garage roof could be depressed to provide suitable soil volume for trees?	KNYMH	Limit of underground parking along the site's northern boundary has been stepped back to allow for suitable soil volumes for tree planting.
	15	The north portion of the parking garage appears to be a linear single-loaded storage area which is somewhat inefficient use of space and could be used towards soft landscaping/trees above if removed or relocated to a more efficient location.	KNYMH	This area single-loaded storage area has been removed and relocated elsewhere.
	16	There does not appear to be an existing or proposed pedestrian connection to the adjacent commercial plaza - confirm if there would be opportunity to create a pedestrian path & link at the Southeast corner of the site that appears to be near a pedestrian pathway in the existing commercial fabric.	UrbanSolutions	Public access from the subject lands to the commercial plaza has not been provided for legal purposes.
	17	Building Sections and Elevations (Note: it appears that the East and West Elevations have been labelled North and South respectively, and that the building plans associated with the Building Sections and Elevations may be mirrored/or rotated to the concept plan with respect to orientation to the north and the locations of entrances	KNYMH	Revised accordingly.
	18	The EIFS cladding (S1) should be reserved for use above the 2nd floor to keep in line with the majority of the cladding	KNYMH	This is not warranted as the eastern elevation in question faces the adjacent commercial plaza.
	19	The mechanical penthouse is drawn generally in line with the exterior face of the building and extends the massing height above the roof level. It would be appropriate to step back from the edge with the mechanical penthouse	KNYMH	This is not warranted as the eastern elevation in question faces the adjacent commercial plaza.
	20	Show property lines on elevations and draw angular plane for reference on the north and west property lines	KNYMH	Property lines shown on updated elevations, angular plane shown on updated elevation drawings.
	21	Sun Shadow Study The study lists the height of the 10-storey building at 19.3 metres - please confirm the model was built according to the submitted Site Plan showing maximum building height as 33.0 m	KNYMH	Please see the enclosed revised Sun Shadow Study indicating the correct building height.
		22	Transportation Impact Study - Revisions Required Transportation Planning notes that a scope of work was not submitted prior to the formal submission of the TIS document. Transportation Planning advises the applicant and consultant that a scope is necessary in order to provide comment on the requirements of the document	NexTrans
23		Transportation Planning requires the Synchro operational review files to be provide prior to the approval of the submitted or subsequent reports	NexTrans	Noted. An electronic copy of the Synchro files have been provided to the City. Nextrans will provide an electronic copy of the Addendum Study Synchro file so that the City can review and provide comments, if any.
24		The Ministry of Transportation (MTO) left-turn lane warrant indicated in Figure 12(1) has been incorrectly completed as the opposing volume (Vo) does not reflect the correct opposing volume based on the future total volume presented in Figure 11(2). The TIS shall be revised accordingly	NexTrans	Noted. The left turn warrant analysis has been revised and provided in Figure 12 of this Addendum Study.

Transportation Planning (Matthew Raedelli)

25	The Consultant indicates that signal timing improvements have been applied to the intersection of West 5th & Stone Church Road West which have been discussed briefly throughout the report. The consultant is required to provide a table indicating the modifications under the sensitivity analysis review in order to clearly identify the proposed signal timing improvements (i.e. increased cycle length +10 seconds, additional protected left-turn phases, modified splits, etc.).	NexTrans	Noted. It should be noted that the signal optimization has been provided on Page 7 for the existing conditions, Page 12 for the future background conditions and Page 17 for the future total conditions. These figures provide a detail signal phasing plan and split for the West 5th Street/Stone Church Road W intersection. Nextrans has provide these changes in Table 9 of this Addendum Study for ease of review and to address the City comments noted above.
26	Transportation Planning does not accept the turning plan provided within the TIS(3) as the location of the reviewed 'loading/waste collection area' is the location of the proposed underground parking ramp (as per the site plan submitted). Revisions to the site plan are required to indicate an appropriate loading/waste collection area which shall be accompanied by a revised turning plan indicating the complete movements of a heavy vehicle servicing the loading/waste collection area.	KNYMH/NexTrans	<u>Nextrans</u> : Noted. The site plan has been revised to separate the underground parking ramp from the loading area. There is a significant separation between the two, which is not anticipated to cause any operational issues. In addition, signage will be provided to warn drivers to stop for a garbage truck when it backs up. The vehicle turning movements have been provided in Figures 15 and 16 of this Study Addendum.
27	The TIS indicates a total of 5 short-term and 108 long-term bicycle parking stalls to be provided by the proposed development. If the proposed site plan differs from the indicated short-term and long-term bicycle parking, the TIS is required to be revised accordingly prior to formal approval of the document.	NexTrans	Noted. The bicycle parking requirements have been updated and provided based on the current proposed site plan layout statistics.
28	Transportation Planning notes the TIS states under Section 9.1.124 'It is Nextrans' opinion that this incentive is not required for this area given the existing context. In addition, as the proposed development is a compact and efficient housing unit design, it will attract young professionals and young family that will use active mode of transportation to make housing more affordable as they can work from home and do not need to drive that often'. Transportation Planning requires documentation and/or proxy data information in support of the consultants' statement regarding not providing additional Transportation Demand Management measures.	NexTrans	Noted. As for TDM measures and incentives, Nextrans has recommended that the proposed development provides one bicycle repair station on site at a publicly accessible location so that residents can use it to fix their bicycles. The ultimate location will be determined at the Site Plan stage.
29	Transportation Demand Management & Transit Oriented Design - Measures Required Short-term and long-term bicycle parking shall be provided as per the City of Hamilton Comprehensive Zoning By-law 05-200. Short term bicycle parking shall be located at grade within the subject property limits. Long-term bicycle parking shall be provided in a secure environment protected by the elements. All shortterm and long-term bicycle parking shall be clearly indicated and illustrated on the site plan.	KNYMH/NexTrans	<u>Nextrans</u> : Noted. The bicycle parking requirements have been updated and provided based on the current proposed site plan layout statistics.
30	Infrastructure Improvements - Information Only As part of future infrastructure improvements along West 5th Street, a centre left-turn lane is to be constructed adjacent to the subject lands as part of the build-out of a future residential subdivision on the west side of West 5th Street as per Application 25T-201305. The Applicant shall discuss potential cost sharing agreement regarding the proposed future works along West 5th with Development Engineering Approvals.	NexTrans	Noted. Nextrans has prepared a functional plan to show the potential two-way centre left turn on West 5th Street to demonstrate how it can be provided without impacting the proposed development.
31	Right of Way Dedications - Required The existing right-of-way at the subject property along West 5th Street is approximately ± 20.0 metres to ± 23.0 metres. ±3.2 metres are required to be dedicated to the right-of-way along West 5th Street, as per the Council Approved Urban Official Plan: Schedule C-2 - Future Rightof- Way Dedications, West 5th Street is to be 26.213 metres from 90 metres south of Stone Church Road to Rymal Road.	NexTrans	Noted.
32	The Applicant will be required to provide a survey conducted by an Ontario Land Surveyor, at their expense, illustrating the right-of-way widening(s). The surveyor is to contact Geomatics and Corridor Management to confirm the right-of-way dedication requirements.	A.T. McLaren	This will be addressed at the Site Plan stage.
33	Site Plan - Future Requirements Transportation Demand Management Measures The Site Plan shall be revised to indicate the total number of short-term and long-term bicycle parking as is required per the City of Hamilton Comprehensive Zoning By-law 05-200. All short-term and long-term bicycle parking shall be clearly indicated, illustrated and numbered on the site plan accordingly	KNYMH/NexTrans	<u>Nextrans</u> : Noted. It has been addressed in the comments above and as a part of this Addendum Study.

	34	Driveway Access 5.0 metres x 5.0 metres visibility triangles must be provided for the proposed driveway access. Visibility triangles are between the driveway limits and the ultimate property line (right-of-way limit) and no object or mature vegetation can exceed a height of 0.6 metres above the corresponding perpendicular centreline elevation of the adjacent street.	KNYMH/NexTrans	KNYMH: 5.0 metres x 5.0 metres visibility triangle included and labelled on revised site plan Nextrans: Noted.
	35	Internal Circulation Transportation Planning notes that a maximum grade percentage of 10% is required as per City of Hamilton Comprehensive Development Guidelines for underground parking ramps. The site plan does not indicate grades leading to the underground parking ramp.	KNYMH/NexTrans	KNYMH: 8% grade labelled on revised Site Plan Nextrans: Noted.
	36	If the proposed ramp grades will not conform to City Development Guidelines, as a condition of Special Condition of Site Plan, prior to application for any building permits, a letter certifying the design of the ramp will be required and signed by a Licenced Architect or Engineer, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Transportation Planning.	KNYMH	Please see above.
	37	A loading/waste collection area has not been indicated on the site plan. Transportation Planning requires a loading/waste collection area to be provided as well as a turning plan to indicate the movements of a heavy vehicle servicing the required loading/waste collection area.	KNYMH/NexTrans	Nextrans: Noted and has been addressed in this Addendum Study.
Growth Management (Industrial and Airport) (Sarah Rogers)	38	It should be determined if there are any implications arising from the adjacent Registered Plan of Subdivision, 62M-1220 (25T-201202), e.g. cost recoveries relating to the registered plan or any reserves to be lifted. It is noted that the subject lands are also adjacent to a defined area of cost recovery. Staff defer to Development Planning and / or Development Engineering Approvals for further comment	UrbanSolutions	To be confirmed by the City of Hamilton.
	39	It should be confirmed if tenure for the subject proposal will be a Condominium. Please note a PIN Abstract would be required with the submission of a future Draft Plan of Condominium application. If the intent is to phase the Condominium, Schedules "G" and "K" as per the Condominium Act, would be required for future phases. If condominium, it should also be confirmed if the proposed parking and storage lockers will be unitized. Staff defer to Development Planning for further comment;	UrbanSolutions	Tenure to be confirmed at a later stage.
	40	It should be confirmed that the at-grade corner entry feature does not project into the proposed visibility triangle, as the subject concept plan shows that the balcony extents meets the hypotenuse, and the corner entry feature projects beyond the balcony extents on the subject elevation plans; and,	UrbanSolutions	No projections are proposed in this location.
	41	The Owner and Agent should be made aware that municipal addressing for the proposed development will be determined after conditional Site Plan approval is granted.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	42	Information Please note that the shoring design must be contained entirely within private property. Encroachment of tiebacks, shoring walls or slopes within the municipal right-of-way is generally not supported by the City. The proponent will be required to enter into a shoring agreement with the City to allow for construction of any shoring works.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	43	The City does not permit any permanent dewatering from foundation drains to the municipal sewer system. The underground wall and foundation must be designed and constructed to be 100% sealed and leak-proof ('bath-tub' design) to avoid the need for any permanent dewatering. Temporary construction dewatering may be permitted in accordance with the City of Hamilton Sewer Use By-law and Temporary Sewer Discharge Permit requirements.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	44	Comments There is currently no municipal storm sewer fronting the subject property. Drainage from the subject lands are accommodated within the William Connell Park stormwater management pond. The subject site will require a storm conveyance system from West 5th Street to the WCP pond, through the future municipal storm sewer on West 5th Street which will be constructed by the developer of the Sheldon's Gate subdivision lands. The proponent can connect to the future municipal storm sewer on West 5th Street subject to submission of a cost recovery collected by the City on behalf of the developer of the Sheldon's Gate subdivision.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
	45	According to our records, there is an outstanding cost recovery for the property. City of Hamilton By-law 07-281 requires that the Owner provide a cash payment to the City in an amount of \$18,000.00 (\$6,000.00 for each lot i.e. 1177, 1183, 1187 West 5th Street) for the construction of the 250mm diameter sanitary sewer by the City on West 5th Street. This cost may be subject to adjustment for inflation.	UrbanSolutions	City of Hamilton to confirm when this payment is required.
	46	The submitted wastewater generation assessment in Appendix B of the FSR calculates the sanitary flow based on the OBC. Peak wastewater flow shall be calculated based on the design flow, peaking factor and infiltration allowance from the City's Development Guidelines Chapter E.1.4. The proposal is for 215 units on 0.513ha (419upha) which is considered high density per the City's Development Guidelines. Therefore, the population of the site shall be calculated based on using 2 people per bedroom.	LandSmith	Site has been calculated using 2 per bedroom.

Development Approvals (Aaron Inrig)

47	The subject lands have an allocated population density of 75ppha. The proposal is for over 1000ppha. Therefore, the proponent shall submit a Sanitary Sewer Analysis of the municipal sanitary sewer fronting the site to confirm if there is sufficient capacity within the municipal system to support the proposed intensification or any required upgrades.	LandSmith	Sanitary Sewer caculation sheet and Sanitary Drainage Area Plan has been included within this submission. Existing sewer has adequate capacity to service proposed development.
48	For information: Once the design concept has been revised to meet City standards and approved by Development Approvals staff, we will recommend that a Holding Provision be placed on the lands to prohibit any construction on-site until the municipal storm sewer on West 5th Street has been constructed and is fully operational as an outlet for the subject site.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
49	Water Servicing - Public Works Hamilton <i>Water Demands:</i> The maximum domestic water demand for the development, based on an approximate fixture unit approach, has been calculated as 18.8 L/s/ This calculation is acceptable.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
50	Please note that the building floor area, building height, building materials, occupancy and exposure distances should be checked to be compliant with the RFF calculations at the site plan approval and building permit stages.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
51	The provided information is satisfactory to support the Official Plan and Zoning Bylaw Amendment applications. We have no concerns from a water servicing perspective at this time. Updated domestic water usage and RFF calculations, based on the final design of the proposed building, will be required at the time of detailed design and site plan approval application.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
52	Sanitary and Minor Storm Servicing (Public Works - Hamilton Water) <i>Sanitary Servicing:</i> Please refer to the attached drawing 07-S-08_2 through _5. There is an existing 250mm @ 0.5% sanitary sewer on West 5th St that services 1187 and 1183, and an existing 375mm @ 0.5% sanitary sewer that services 1177 West 5th. Wastewater capacity has been allocated in the municipal system for these three properties based on a population density of 75ppha. While Section 2.2 of the FSR does speak to the overall capacity of these sewers, it does not address the availability of/residual capacity to accommodate the proposed population density of 1064ppha.	LandSmith	Sanitary Sewer caculation sheet and Sanitary Drainage Area Plan has been included within this submission. Existing sewer has adequate capacity to service proposed development.
53	Prior to approval of the Zoning and Official Plan amendment applications, the Proponent is required to complete a hydraulic analysis of the sanitary sewer from its upstream limit to MH HG20A039 (MH 7A on the attached drawing _2) to demonstrate that the wastewater generated from the proposed development will not adversely impact the hydraulic performance of the City's sanitary sewer system. The Proponent will need to consult with the Growth Management Division to include all approved and in progress applications that also require capacity allocation within this section of sewer.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
54	The following comments are provided to facilitate future submissions: Section 2.2, 1st paragraph: the existing sanitary sewer on West 5th is not a trunk sewer, please revise; and as per the Urbex plans provided as well as the attached City drawings the 375mm sewer is 0.5% slope, please revise.	LandSmith	Revised.
55	<i>Minor Storm Servicing:</i> HW has no comments related to minor storm servicing at this time. However, there are a number of typos in Section 2.3, particularly in flow values, that require revision.	LandSmith	Acknowledged, Revised Flow Values.
56	Stormwater Management (Infrastructure Planning) The proponent should coordinate with the adjacent Sheldon Gate development for installation of future storm sewer on West 5th Street/Street 'A' to provide minor and major storm outlet through West 5th Street/'Street A' up to downstream William Connell Park SWM pond.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
57	Source Water Protection (Public Works - Hamilton Water) To the satisfaction of Director, Hamilton Water, Source Water Protection would require a Hydrogeological Brief conducted by a qualified professional (P.Eng, P.Geo) that discusses soil/groundwater conditions to properly characterize potential dewatering needs. This brief should discuss seasonal high groundwater levels, excavation depths, dewatering calculations (on a L/s and L/day basis), and if dewatering is required, groundwater quality sampling to compare against Sewer Use Bylaw criteria. The majority of these information requests can be provided if the applicant requires a geotechnical report to support the development without duplication of effort.	UrbanSolutions	This will be provided at the Site Plan stage.

	58	As information, in order to comply with City of Hamilton Sewer Use Bylaw standards and Temporary Sewer Discharge Permit requirements, discharge location (manhole ID), peak dewatering rate (L/s), and representative water quality will be required. It is recommended to consult with the Superintendent of Environmental Monitoring and Enforcement Group within Hamilton Water as early as possible in the approval process, given that additional review may be required by Hamilton Water to verify the wastewater system could accept the quantity and/or quality of the discharge. Email sewerusebylaw@hamilton.ca to better understand water discharges to City infrastructure. If dewatering is expected to exceed 50,000 L/day, registration with the Environmental Activity Sector Registry or a Permit to Take Water from the Ministry of Environment, Conservation, and Parks may be required.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
	59	Due to limited capacity in the municipal sewer system among other factors, the applicant shall demonstrate that no long-term dewatering (due to elevated groundwater levels) will be conveyed to municipal sewer infrastructure. Foundations/subsurface structures shall be designed/waterproofed accordingly.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
	60	Recommendations: The Development Engineering Approvals Section is unable to support this application moving forward until such time that the proponent revises the sanitary demand calculations in accordance with the City's Development Guidelines and submits a sanitary capacity analysis to demonstrate that there is sufficient unallocated capacity in the existing municipal system. The proponent has adequately demonstrated that the existing municipal water system can adequately supply the required fire flow (RFF) for the proposed development.	LandSmith	Sanitary Sewer caculation sheet and Sanitary Drainage Area Plan has been included within this submission. Existing sewer has adequate capacity to service proposed development.
Forestry (Sam Brush)	61	Tree #16 has been misidentified and shall be changed to Acer negundo. This tree along with the <5cm buckthorn shall be removed within the canopy of tree #17	Adesso Design	Tree #16 has been corrected as noted. A note has been added to the TPP regarding the buckthorn.
	62	Tree #19 shall be corrected to be shown as Acer nigrum	Adesso Design	Tree #19 has been corrected as noted.
	63	Landscape Plan The Forestry & Horticulture Section requires that a detailed Landscape Planting Plan prepared by a Registered Landscape Architect, showing the placement of trees on internal/external City property be provided.	UrbanSolutions	A Landscape Plan will be provided at the Site Plan stage.
	64	The City of Hamilton's Public Tree Preservation and Sustainability Policy in conjunction with the Tree By-Law 15-125 requires new developments to provide payment of \$670.96 plus HST per tree for road allowance street trees. All street tree plantings shall be planted by the City of Hamilton, as approved through the review of a proposed street tree planting scheme.	UrbanSolutions	Street Tree fees to be provided at the Site Plan stage.
	65	All trees shown on municipal road allowance shall be identified as 'Trees to be planted by City of Hamilton Forestry Section.	Adesso Design	All trees shown on municipal road allowance will be identified as such.
	66	The Landscape Plan should specifically outline 50mm caliper size and the species of trees to be planted as well as identify hard surface and soft surface areas on the site. Individually planted trees in new sidewalk installations shall include a detail showing 21 m3 of soil, and a grouping of 2 or more trees in a soil bed shall include 16m3 of soil per tree. New sidewalks, paving or asphaltting shall allow 1.5m2 of breathing space for tree roots.	Adesso Design	Noted. The noted items will be included with the submission of the landscape plan at the Site Plan stage.
	67	An option to allow forestry to determine tree species is permitted and plan shall reflect that decision by denoting on plan 'City of Hamilton forestry department to determine species. Please note; all private trees on plan shall have species denoted.	Adesso Design	Noted. The noted items will be included with the submission of the landscape plan at the Site Plan stage.
	68	Tree species selection should take into account cultivars (fruitless etc.) salt and heat tolerance, mature tree size, public visibility and daylight triangles, as well as potential pest concerns. Spacing guidelines for trees are ten 8-10m on centre for larger species and 6-7 metres on centre for smaller species.	Adesso Design	Noted.
	69	Guidelines for species diversity shall ensure no single species shall make up more than 20% of the total street tree population. No coniferous trees will be permitted on City of Hamilton road allowance. Any identified street tree species on plan will be subject to change at time of planting due to but limited to; on site conditions, in stock availability and compatibility with approved species by City of Hamilton. Although utility conflicts may change specific planting locations, every opportunity will be made to keep with the intent of the design. Trees planted on the road allowance will have a minimum approximate caliper of 50 mm.	Adesso Design	Noted.

Morgan Gowans	70	In the comments it notes that based on the commercial plazas distance separation and shielding, the rooftop HVAC units and bay doors to facilitate transport truck deliveries will not have adverse impacts on the proposed development. Staff would required some elaboration to these comments as to how there will not be any impacts as the existing townhouse development to the north provided a 2.43 noise barrier wall.	dBA Acoustical Consultants	<p>The 2.43m noise barrier wall is only along the east portion of the existing townhouse development to the north of the subject site and is required to mitigate the transport truck noise levels at the rear yard outdoor living areas (OLA's). The proposed apartment building is in excess of 130m from the commercial plaza and only a small portion of the commercial plaza is visible to the proposed apartment building, however there are not any truck bays in that portion of the plaza.</p> <p>Truck Calculations:</p> <p>An example of noise calculations for a standard transport truck is as follows.</p> <p>1m from source ÷ 130m to proposed apartment building = (Log X 20 = -42 which in turn is calculated by 75.5 dBA truck sound level – 42 dBA = 33.5 dBA. Time calculation 10min ÷ 60min = (Log X 10) = - 7.8 dBA. Therefore 33.5 dBA – 7.8 dBA = 25.7 dBA at the east façade of the proposed apartment building. Traffic background noise is anticipated to be higher than the transport truck noise.</p>
	71	We would recommend that 3 noise receptors be places on the east side of the proposed building to determine any noise impacts from the commercial plaza.	dBA Acoustical Consultants	The noise study has recommended that all windows, patio doors and exterior walls meet the criteria noted below in Table 6, that represents the highest noise level of 63 dBA for West 5th west façade. All other facades have lower dBA traffic noise levels; therefore, it was recommended that all windows, patio doors and exterior walls have the same STC ratings to ensure that all interior noise levels have been achieved. (Please refer to Table 6 in Noise Study Addendum prepared by dBA Acoustical Consultants).
Sustainable Communities (Melanie Pham)	72	A neighbourhood plan amendment is required to implement the proposal. Should approval be recommended, the recommendation report should include a recommendation to amend the Mewburn Neighbourhood Plan map to identify the lands as "High Density Apartments".	UrbanSolutions	City of Hamilton to initiate, if required.
	73	The proposal is for a high density residential use, which is a permitted use in the Neighbourhoods Designation, subject to meeting the High Density Residential policies. Also, the Planning Justification report submitted with the application provides detailed policy comments related to the Neighbourhoods Designation and the High Density Residential policies (pages 30 to 34). Staff request clarification as to why the change to a Mixed Use - Medium Density Designation is necessary as the High Density Residential policies in Section E.3.6 are appropriate and could be applied to the proposal.	UrbanSolutions	Given that the subject property is designated 'Neighbourhoods' in the UHOP, and that OPA No. 167effectively removed all density requirements on an individual site basis, it is our (UrbanSolutions') understanding that an Official Plan Amendment is no longer required to facilitate the propsoed development.
	74	An Official Plan Amendment is still required to permit the density of the proposal, which exceeds the maximum of 200 units per hectare.	UrbanSolutions	Given that the subject property is designated 'Neighbourhoods' in the UHOP, and that OPA No. 167effectively removed all density requirements on an individual site basis, it is our (UrbanSolutions') understanding that an Official Plan Amendment is no longer required to facilitate the propsoed development.

Waste Management (Diane	75	As currently designed, the development is not servicable for the following reasons: The Site Plan does not illustrate a multi-sort waste chute system for the building. The City requires separate collection of recyclable containers, recyclable papers, organic waste, and garbage. Additional information shall be provided on the proposed method to collect the four waste streams. The chute system will require appropriate safety measure and shall be restricted from public access.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	76	A development with 215 residential units will require sufficient waste containers to service all units as follows: - 8 front-end bin containers (3 cubic yard size) for recycling collection. Separate front-end bin containers shall be provided for the collection of recyclable paper materials and recyclable container materials. - 2 front-end bin containers (2 cubic yard size) for organic waste collection. - 13 front-end bin containers (3 cubic yard size) for uncompacted garbage collection or 6 front-end bin containers (3 cubic yard size) for compacted garbage. - Each front-end bin requires a minimum storage space of 5.0 m2.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	77	The site plan is missing information on the size of the internal waste storage area. The internal waste storage area must be large enough to store the required waste containers based on the number of dwelling units in the building. A multi-residential building with 215 dwelling units will require 125 m2 of space to store the waste containers if the building has uncompacted garbage collection, including 10 m2 for storage of bulk waste and cardboard.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	78	The site plan illustrates a garbage room on each floor; however, it's not clear if this is meant for the waste chute or if this is for waste storage. The Applicant shall provide clarification if the proposed garbage rooms on each floor are meant to be used for the waste chute or waste storage.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	79	The site plan indicates the size of the waste staging area to temporarily store the front-end bins on the waste collection day is 31.55 m2. The staging area requires at least 5 m2 of space for each front-end bin container.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	80	The waste loading area requires additional information on the following: - the proposed waste loading area requires vertical clearance of 7.0 metres - The loading area must permit one of the following options for waste collection vehicle(s): - A turnaround area allowing for a maximum three-point turn of not more than one truck length; - An area which the waste collection vehicle may drive through in a continuous forward motion. - The location of the waste loading area shall avoid the waste collection vehicles from reversing onto a municipal road.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	81	Information is missing concerning the proposed travel route for the waste collection vehicles. The proposed travel route for the waste collection vehicles must allow the vehicles to move in a continuous forward motion. The travel route requires the following information: - The size of the waste vehicle shall be illustrated; - The site plan illustrates a 10-metre turning radii from the centre line for all internal roads which does not meets the City's requirements. The City requires a 13-metre turning radii from the centre line for all internal roads. - The site plan illustrates a 6-metre access route width from the centre line for all internal roads which meets the City's requirements. - Permit waste collection vehicle(s) to exit the development without being required to reverse onto a municipal road. - Access routes shall have a minimum overhead clearance of 4.4 metres	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	82	The following must be shown on the Site Plan to receive municipal waste collection: An internal storage room that is ventilated, rodent-proof and separate from the living space with adequate space to store the required number of waste containers for the building. The storage room must comply with the Ontario Building Code.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	83	Chutes will have lock-out and washing mechanisms.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
	84	If a garbage compactor is proposed, it will be inaccessible to residents.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.

Butterworth)

85	<p>If an external garbage enclosure is proposed for the development, it shall include the following requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • enclosure for a single front-end garbage bin – clearance width of 4.25 metres • enclosure with two gates for two front-end garbage bins – clearance width of 8.5 metres • the outside gates of the garbage enclosure shall swing open 135 degrees • the garbage enclosure shall have free and clear overhead access with a minimum of 7.0 metres of overhead clearance. 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
86	<p>Loading and staging area shall meet the following requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • minimum loading area size requirements is 3.5 metres wide by 13 metres long • the loading area must have a vertical clearance of at least 7 metres throughout • the staging area requires at least 5 m² of space for each front-end bin container • the staging pad shall be at grade or not more than 1.0 metres above the loading area • the loading and staging area shall be in an area which avoids potential conflicts with pedestrian or vehicle traffic 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
87	<p>Access roads shall meet the following requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • internal roads must have a minimum width of 6.0 metres for two-way traffic or 3.0 metres for one-way traffic • internal roads must have a 13 metre turning radii from the centre line. • access routes have a maximum grade of 8%. • access routes have a minimum overhead clearance of 4.4 metres 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
88	The road base over a supported structure must support of minimum of 35,000 kilograms and 6,000 kilograms point load.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
89	The loading area shall be constructed with a minimum of 0.02 metres of reinforced concrete.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
90	Road layout must be designed to allow continuous forward movement of the collection vehicles exclusive of parking spaces and/or stored snow. The anticipated movement of the waste collection vehicle must be shown on the site plan using AutoTURN or other similar software.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
91	The collection area must be designed to allow a waste collection vehicle to drive forward onto the site, collect the waste, and exit without the need to back up onto a municipal road. The internal roadway towards the collection area must be level (i.e. +/-2%), and the same width as the collection area at minimum.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
92	<p>The vehicle travel path will require traffic safety signage, which includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No parking signs will be installed along all loading areas, vehicle turnaround areas and along one-way drives which are part of the waste collection vehicle access route. • Wherever a waste collection vehicle will reverse over a pedestrian travel path or any other place where it is reasonable to believe a pedestrian would walk, warning lights to indicate that a waste collection vehicle may be reversing will be located on either side of the pedestrian travel path and will be activated whenever a waste collection vehicle is operating in the area. • Mirrors will be installed in all locations, internal or external to a building, where waste collection vehicles will travel in a forward motion and where walls and other impediments may challenge the ability of waste collection vehicle drivers to safely view the access route around corners. 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
93	<p>Revised Drawings must include: A diagram detailing the travel route of waste collection vehicle(s) using AutoTURN or other similar software. The travel route must include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> measurements for access route widths; turning radii for all turns; and information regarding how the waste collection vehicle(s) will be able to exit the development without reversing onto any municipal roads. 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
94	<p>The inclusion of a waste collection area for front-end containers which meets the requirements set out in the Memorandum.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> the vertical clearance of the waste collection area must be at least 7.0 metres. 	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.
95	Revision of the proposed waste storage area to make it large enough to store all required waste containers.	KNYMH	Municipal vs. Private waste collection services to be confirmed at the Site Plan stage.

Transit Planning and Infrastructure (Andy McLaughlin)	96	As outlined in the Transportation Impact Study, the existing asphalt walkway located on the east side of West 5th Street is not in good condition. HSR requests that the existing concrete sidewalk located north of the site be extended along the site's frontage. Also, the asphalt walkway, and associated storm drainage infrastructure, that extends from the south end of the site to Rymal Road West should be refurbished, such that it will be in good condition upon resident move-in. These upgrades will assist in optimising walking conditions for pedestrians wishing to access transit using the bus stops on Rymal Road West at West 5th Street.	KNYMH	The design of the boulevard and West 5th Street will be determined at the Site Plan stage.
Strategic Planning	97	We request cash in lieu of parkland dedication if applicable. Amenity space shall not count toward parkland dedication.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	98	JV - West Fifth is scheduled to be urbanized and potentially widened along the frontage of the subject lands in 2025. Any servicing works within the West Fifth right-of-way required for this development should be completed before that time. If that is not possible, efforts should be made to coordinate servicing connections with Public Works as part of their design. Any access connections (sidewalks, driveways, etc.) should be designed with consideration for this future urbanization and widening of West Fifth.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
HCA (Cathy Plosz)	99	As per IBI's Drawing DR1 "Updated Future Ultimate Conditions Subcatchment Boundary Plan" revised February 18, 2016, the subject site is part of Area C-67F and Area C-68F with the post-development imperviousness of 65%. Figure S2 provided in Appendix C of the FSR suggests that the overall post-development imperviousness is 73.3%. Therefore, demonstration is required that the William Connell Park SWM facility can safely accommodate the increased site imperviousness or additional quality controls should be considered before discharging storm water to the municipal storm sewer.	LandSmith	CB Shields are now proposed in all area drains. These will provide the required quality improvement due to the site's increased imperviousness.
	100	A siltation control fencing should be erected as per OPDS 219.130/131 revised November, 2015. Appropriate detail drawing is required.	LandSmith	Revised Silt fence note to be 219.130.
	101	A detail of silt sacks that must be installed in all catch basins until the full completion of construction works should be provided.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
	102	If a mud mat is proposed at the construction entranceway, it should be installed as per Drawing 05, dated March 2019, available in the Erosion and Sediment Control Guideline for Urban Construction, TRCA, 2019.	LandSmith	Acknowledged.
Planning (Mark Michniak)	103	Planning Justification Report Staff are unclear why a change in land use designation is requested as the proposed development does not include any commercial components. Furthermore, the existing designation allows for residential development at various densities. Provide further justification in the PJR or remove this amendment.	UrbanSolutions	Agreed. Given that the subject property is designated 'Neighbourhoods' in the UHOP, and that OPA No. 167 removed all density requirements on an individual site basis, it is our (UrbanSolutions') understanding that an Official Plan Amendment is no longer required to facilitate the proposed development.
	104	The analysis found in Section 5.1 has not provided sufficient rationale to support the Official Plan and Zoning By-law amendments. Include additional rationale to support the increases in height and density in the UHOP and the modifications to height, setback, and landscaping regulations in the Zoning By-law.	UrbanSolutions	Additional rationale has been provided in the enclosed Cover Letter.
	105	Provide further analysis of UHOP intensification policies found in Chapter B Section 2.4.1.4 and 2.4.2.2.	UrbanSolutions	Additional analysis has been provided in the enclosed Cover Letter.
	106	Draft Official Plan Amendment Consider removing land use designation amendment as per PJR comments above.	UrbanSolutions	Noted, please see above response to Comment No. 103.
	107	Draft Zoning By-law Amendment Add a regulation that implements the maximum density proposed in the OPA Amendment.	UrbanSolutions	N/A
	108	Add a 1.5m planting strip requirement where abutting a Residential Zone.	UrbanSolutions	Due to the location of the proposed retaining wall and concrete pad for the transformer, the requirement for a 1.5 metre planting strip has not been included in the revised Draft Zoning By-law. However, provisions for enhanced landscaping along the subject site's northern boundary will be included in a future Site Plan submission.
	109	Add a regulation specifying the amount of outdoor and indoor amenity space provided.	UrbanSolutions	Please refer to the revised Draft Zoning By-law prepared by UrbanSolutions.
	110	The 6th floor setback from West 5th Street, as indicated by the UDB and Elevation drawings, is missing.	UrbanSolutions	Please refer to the revised Draft Zoning By-law prepared by UrbanSolutions.
	111	Planning Building Sections and Elevations Provide angular plane for reference on the north and west property lines.	KNYMH	Included in revised submission package.

Building Zoning and Engineering (Alyssa Vaccari)	112	E3 Zone + Proposed Site Specifics Chart saved to project correspondence folder	UrbanSolutions	N/A
	113	<p>It is recommended that the applicant provide additional and updated information on the Concept Plan for a future rezoning application with respect to the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dimensions of the proposed canopy - Height of the outdoor stairway and ramp that is above grade. Setbacks for the proposed open stairways to the property line - Distance of 1st storey porch to front property line - Column/pier width and distance - Mechanical equipment (transformer) information 	UrbanSolutions	Please refer to the revised Draft Zoning By-law prepared by UrbanSolutions and revised Site Plan prepared by KNYMH.
	114	Construction of the proposed building is subject to the issuance of a building permit in the normal manner. Be advised that Ontario Building Code regulations may require specific setback and construction types.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	115	The proposed development would require the issuance of demolition permits to remove any existing buildings.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	116	All proposed fences shall conform to the requirements of the Fence By-law.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	117	All proposed signs shall conform to the requirements of the Sign By-law.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.
	118	The designer shall ensure that the fire access route conforms to the Ontario Building Code.	UrbanSolutions	Noted.